Comment on "Axion Dark Matter Coupling to Resonant Photons via Magnetic Field"

Sangjun Lee,[1,2] Sung Woo Youn,[2] and Y. K. Semertzidis[1,2]
[1]*Dept. of physics, KAIST, Daejeon 34141 Republic of Korea*
[2]*Center for Axion and Precision Physics Research, IBS, Daejeon 34141 Republic of Korea*
(Dated: June 29, 2016)

arXiv:1606.09504v1 [hep-ex] 29 Jun 2016

A recent Letter [1] claims that for typical dark matter axion search experiments using cylindrical haloscopes, the power gain depends on the relative position of a cavity with respect to the center of a solenoidal magnetic field due to different electric and magnetic couplings. We review this Letter and find a misinterpretation of the coordinate system. We correct this and see no dependence of the coupling strength on the cavity location and the electric and magnetic energies stored in a cavity mode are equal.

From the modified Maxwell's equations in the presence of axion-photon coupling with the background axion field $a = a_0 e^{-i\omega_a t}$, the electromagnetic field components of photons produced via the axion-photon conversion inside the solenoid producing homogeneous magnetic field $\vec{B}_0 = B_0\hat{z}$ are obtained as

$$\vec{E}_a = -g_{a\gamma\gamma} a c B_0 \hat{z}, \qquad \vec{B}_a = -\frac{g_{a\gamma\gamma}}{2c} r B_0 \frac{\partial a}{\partial t}\hat{\phi}, \tag{1}$$

where $g_{a\gamma\gamma}$ is the axion-photon coupling constant and (r, ϕ) is the polar coordinate system of the solenoid. Since $\vec{E}_a$ and $\vec{B}_a$ are determined by the boundary condition of the solenoid, they do not depend on the location of the cavity.

Denoting by $\vec{E}_c$ and $\vec{B}_c$ the electric and magnetic fields of a resonant cavity mode, the electric and magnetic energies stored in the cavity mode from the axion-to-photon conversion are given by

$$U_{a,e} = \frac{1}{4}\epsilon_0 g_{a\gamma\gamma}^2 a^2 c^2 B_0^2 V C_E, \tag{2}$$

$$U_{a,m} = \frac{1}{4}\epsilon_0 g_{a\gamma\gamma}^2 a^2 c^2 B_0^2 V C_B, \tag{3}$$

with the electric and magnetic form factors being defined, respectively, as

$$C_E = \frac{\left|\int dV_c\ \vec{E}_c \cdot \hat{z}\right|^2}{V\int dV_c \left|E_c\right|^2}, \quad C_B = \frac{\frac{\omega_a^2}{c^2}\left|\int dV_c\ \frac{r}{2}\vec{B}_c \cdot \hat{\phi}\right|^2}{V\int dV_c \left|B_c\right|^2}, \tag{4}$$

where the integration is over the cavity volume.

At a first glance, C_B in Eq. 4 would produce different results when the cavity is no longer coaxial with the solenoid and has some offset e due to the apparent radial dependence (C_E remains unchanged since $\vec{E}_a$ is homogeneous inside the solenoid). However, in the presence of the offset, $\vec{B}_c$ lies in the azimuthal direction in the cavity coordinates, $\hat{\phi}_c$, while r and $\hat{\phi}$ in the integrand of C_B remain the same in the solenoid coordinates since these are due to the $\vec{B}_a$ field. Thus we evaluate the dot product between $\hat{\phi}_c$ and $\hat{\phi}$, i.e., $\hat{\phi}_c \cdot \hat{\phi} = \cos(\phi + \phi_c) = -[r_c - e\cos\phi_c]/r$. Then C_B in Eq. 4 becomes

$$C_B = \frac{\frac{\omega_a^2}{c^2}\left|\int dV_c\ B_{c_{\phi_c}} \frac{r_c - e\cos\phi_c}{2}\right|^2}{V\int dV_c \left|B_c\right|^2}. \tag{5}$$

Recalling the corresponding expression in the Letter,

$$C_B = \frac{\frac{\omega_a^2}{c^2}\left|\int dV_c\ B_{c_{\phi}} \frac{r - e\cos\phi}{2}\right|^2}{V\int dV_c \left|B_c\right|^2}, \tag{6}$$

we find the radial and azimuthal coordinates are interpreted in the solenoid system rather than the cavity system, which in turn results in C_B varying with the offset. It must be emphasized that r_c and ϕ_c are the polar coordinates of the cavity. Now the $\cos\phi_c$ term in the integrand of Eq. 5 vanishes after integration over the cavity volume. Therefore, it is found that C_B has no position (offset e) dependence in the solenoid and has the same value as C_E, e.g., $C_B = C_E = 0.69$ for the TM_{010} mode.

This work was supported by IBS-R017-D1-2016-a00/IBS-R017-Y1-2016-a00. We also thank S. H. Chang at the Center for Theoretical Physics of the Universe (CTPU) of Institute for Basic Science (IBS) for his confirmation of our finding.

[1] B. T. McAllister, S. R. Parker, and M. E. Tobar, "Axion Dark Matter Coupling to Resonant Photons via Magnetic Field", Phys. Rev. Lett. **116**, 161804 (2016).